Differential Attainment Update
Dr. Fatima El Bakri
Associate Dean
Ethnicity Differential Attainment

• Difference between the average attainment of:
  – White UK graduate trainees and the average attainment of BAME UK graduate trainees
  – Of ALL UK graduates and average attainments of international medical graduates (IMGs) and European Economic Area graduates (EEA)
• Indicators are: ARCP outcomes, exam pass rates & overall satisfaction (NTS OvS) from the national trainee survey
• Programme level data
Data Update
Updated in Oct 2019

- ARCP and exam data covers four years 2014-2018
- Exam data is all exam attempts in the programme
- NTS Overall satisfaction data is from 2019
- The figures are mean percentages
- Exam failure has been filtered out of ARCP outcomes
- Some speciality data is incomplete
## Demographical changes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>UK PMQ White</th>
<th>UK PMQ BAME</th>
<th>EEA PMQ</th>
<th>IMG PMQ</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wessex 2019</td>
<td>1150 (64%)</td>
<td>342 (19%)</td>
<td>93 (5%)</td>
<td>207 (12%)</td>
<td>1792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>(71%)</td>
<td>(17%)</td>
<td>(4%)</td>
<td>(8%)</td>
<td>1804</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>UK PMQ White</td>
<td>UK PMQ BAME</td>
<td>EEA PMQ</td>
<td>IMG PMQ</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KSS</td>
<td>1449 (47%)</td>
<td>978 (32%)</td>
<td>153 (5%)</td>
<td>477 (16%)</td>
<td>3057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW</td>
<td>2372 (80%)</td>
<td>364 (12%)</td>
<td>84 (3%)</td>
<td>195 (7%)</td>
<td>2985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV</td>
<td>884 (52%)</td>
<td>557 (32%)</td>
<td>97 (6%)</td>
<td>178 (10%)</td>
<td>1716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wessex 2019</td>
<td>1150 (64%)</td>
<td>342 (19%)</td>
<td>93 (5%)</td>
<td>207 (12%)</td>
<td>1792</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Wessex Combined Specialties

![Bar chart showing ARCP, Exam, and NTS OvS results for UK PMQ White and UK PMQ BME.]

- ARCP: 96 (UK PMQ White), 95 (UK PMQ BME)
- Exam: 80 (UK PMQ White), 66 (UK PMQ BME)
- NTS OvS: 81 (UK PMQ White), 79 (UK PMQ BME)
Wessex Combined Specialties
Summary of the Root Causes

Research & evidence (including local) suggest that the root causes are:

1. Problematic relationships with seniors (lack of trust and support)
2. Perceived bias in recruitment & workplace based assessments
3. Lack of support in and outside work
Support & Challenge

High Challenge
- Persecution
- Stress from overload
- Fear
- Anger
- Paranoia
- Confronting
- Threatening
- Back-stabbing
- Lonely
- Risk-taking
- Eager
- Collaborating
- Purposeful
- Learning
- Fun
- Exciting
- Energetic
- Creative
- Achieving
- Stretching

Low Support
- Indifference
- Frustration
- Boredom
- Stress from underload
- Cold
- Drifting
- Unclear
- Uncommitted
- Smothered
- Frustrated
- Not developed
- Vagueness
- Caring
- Cosy/comfortable
- Non-confronting
- Under-achieving

Low Challenge
What did we Do?
Wessex DA Framework

- Started in Oct 2018
- The IMG fellowship (*Stuart Purcell*)
- Focused on getting the balance right
- Adopted an evidence-based approach
- Avoided approaches that re-enforce the deficit model
- Included non training grade doctors
- Predominantly trust-based courses
Educational Governance & leadership

• DA is part of the HEE south; four work streams for Equality, Diversity & Inclusion (EDI)
• Established a Wessex EDI group
• DA is included in associate Dean’s portfolio
• Appointed three fellows due to start in February 2020. one day/week/fellow
• Tier II visa alerts and invitation to IMG induction
• SRTT package for IMGs with additional HEE funded supervision 1 hr/week/trainee for the first four weeks, extendable on individual basis
Supporting Educators

- HEE south DA workshop in Bristol April 2019 and Winchester Nov 2019 which included unconscious bias training. Attended by 81 educators and managers
- HEE south recorded webinar with Kath Woolf in June 2019
- Sharing Wessex DA data with HOS, DMEs, TPDs, SAS tutors & education centre managers
- DA presentation at the annual senior educator conference in Jan 2019 with IMG fellows
Supporting Educators

• DA sessions for Educational supervisor faculty development days in May & Oct 2019

• Educational supervisor refreshers: Wajid’s project (92 ESs)
  – June 2019 Dorset healthcare
  – June 2019 QA
  – August 2019 HHFT
  – September 2019 Southern House
  – November 2019 RBCH

• TPD workshop (Mariam’s project) in Sept 2019 to explore research findings and what can be done
Supporting Learners

- IMG Induction: Maryam’s Project: a two day course held in:
  - June 2019 in the IOW
  - July 2019 at SH
  - Aug 2019 at QA
  - Aug 2019 at RBCH
  - Sept 2019 at HHFT
- Covers: GMC welcome to UK practice, communication and professional persona, Employment rules, career advice, resilience, QI/Audit, patient safety, ARCP and revalidation
- Attended by over 100 SAS and trainee doctors
Supporting Learners

• DA slot at welcome to Wessex
• Working with centre managers to ensure IMGs’ are released to attend tailored courses
• IMGs Handbook with information for doctors new to the NHS Wael’s project
• Examination up skilling course Nkolika’s project: held in Sep and Dec 2019. included sessions on communication under stress, cultural differences and examination preparation and techniques led by Hilary
• Access to coaching and mentoring via TVWLA
Learning Environment & Culture

• Positive messaging and rebranding Wessex as BAME friendly: website and a world map with countries represented in Wessex *(Nkolika).* ongoing

• Qualitative study of UK graduates’ perspective on working alongside IMGs *(Mariam)* to promote inclusive learning environments. Presented at the MEF conference in Nov 2019

• Supervising IMGs workshop *(Wajid)* at MEF conference in Nov 2019
Next steps
Plan for 2020/2021

• A solution-based plan explored with researchers and other teams
• DA as part of the annual quality reports
• ES refreshers on supervising IMGs booked on 5/3/2020 at Southern House ? To continue or not
• DA session with a slide pack and video for the ES faculty
• DA for TPD/HOS/DME induction
• A Wessex IMG charter to ensure a standard approach
• Tier II/IV visa alert set up. Trainees will be invited to induction
Plan for 2020/2021

• Five IMGs induction course for 2020/21 using same format; open to all IMG doctors
• Continue DA presentation as part of welcome to Wessex using a video
• Adoption of an In Training Profiler with tailored support using recruitment scores at bottom 20% and ARCP outcomes 2 &3
• Online IMG support forum and Buddy system
• Promoting Coaching and mentoring
Plan for 2020/2021

• Website review and creation of a learning environment for IMGs in collaboration with Solent University to create content e.g. positive messages, case study videos from trainees and trainers, relevant information for trainers and trainees

• Tailored SAS projects: working with SAS tutors to understand their needs and ensure better alignment e.g. CESR course, career coaching
Is This Good Enough?
What interventions are likely to work?

• Positive trainer-trainee relationship through:
  – Valuing contributions
  – Time to support trainees
  – Sponsorships for All (belief, trust etc.)
  – Inclusive advocacy schemes
  – High challenge with support (Steeling)

• Role models and inspiring trainers
Facilitating mixed peer support

- Random allocation to activities (to teaching groups; to pair/group work within teaching groups).
- “Getting to know you” activities in formal setting.
- Facilitating inclusive extra-curricular social activities (not just going to the pub).
- Emphasise shared identities (e.g. specialty or practice identity)

\[ \uparrow \text{intergroup contact} = \downarrow \text{prejudice} \]

Ashford & Mael (1989) Acad Man Rev
“What supported your success in training?”

A qualitative exploration of the factors associated with an absence of an ethnic attainment gap in post-graduate specialty training

Final report
Submitted 15th November 2019

Victoria Roe
Professor Fiona Patterson
Dr Máire Kerrín
Diversity Enhances Creativity

Questions/Suggestions?